



# RESTITUTION

2004 — 2005

Professor E.J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 30 2004

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

# RESTITUTION

2004 — 2005

Professor E.J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/restitution00wein>

## Restitution

### I. THE NATURE OF RESTITUTION

Aristotle, Nicomachean Ethics, Book Five 1129a26 - 1132b20, (Ostwald trans.) .....	1
Corrective Justice in a Nutshell, Ernest J. Weinrib.....	6
<i>Edwards v. Lee's Administrator</i> , 96 S.W. (2d) 1028 (Ky. C.A., 1936) .....	13
<i>Vincent v. Lake Erie Transportation Co.</i> (1910), 124 N.W. 222 (Minn. S.C.) .....	17
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937), § 122. Benefits Derived From the Exercise of Incomplete Privilege.....	20
Palmer, The Law of Restitution, Volume I, 139-140 (Boston and Toronto: Little, Brown, 1978).....	22
<i>Foskett v. McKeown</i> [2003] 3 All ER 97 (HL) .....	23

### II. THE DEVELOPMENT OF RESTITUTION

<i>Moses v. MacFerlan</i> (1760), 97 E.R. 676, 2 Burr. 1005 (K.B.).....	35
Dobbs, Handbook on the Law of Remedies, (St. Paul: West, 1973) 229.....	38
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937).....	53
Seavey and Scott, Restitution, (1938) 54 Law Quarterly Review 29, 29-32, 36-39.....	55
<i>Deglman v. Guaranty Trust Co. and Constantineau</i> , [1954] S.C.R. 725; [1954] 3 D.L.R. 785 .....	59
<i>Pavey &amp; Matthews Proprietary Ltd. v. Paul</i> (1986) 162 C.L.R. 221 (H.C. Australia) .....	61
<i>Pettikus v. Becker</i> (1980), 117 D.L.R. (3d) 257 (S.C.C.) .....	66
<i>Peter v. Beblow</i> (1993), 101 D.L.R. (4th) 621 (S.C.C.) .....	74
<i>Dublin v. Building and Allied Trade Union</i> [1996] 2 ILRM 547 (S.C.).....	84

### III. UNREQUESTED BENEFITS

#### 1. Basic Ideas

<i>Taylor v. Laird</i> (1856), 156 E.R. 1203 .....	91
<i>Moule v. Garrett</i> (1872), L.R. 7 Ex. 101 (Ex. Chamber) .....	92
<i>Brooks Wharf &amp; Bull Wharf, Ltd. v. Goodman Bros.</i> , [1936] 3 All E.R. 696 (C.A.) .....	94
<i>Ruabon Steamship Co. v. London Assurance</i> , [1990] A.C. 6 (H.L.) .....	97
<i>Jenkins v. Tucker</i> (1788) 126 ER 555 (C.P.).....	101
<i>Shallcross v. Wright</i> (1850) 50 E.R. 1174.....	102

Restatement of Restitution - s. 2 .....	104
Birks, An Introduction to the Law of Restitution (1985) 101-103.....	105

## 2. Preserving Another's Property

<i>Nicholson v. Chapman</i> (1793) 126 E.R. 536 (C.P.).....	107
<i>Falcke v. Scottish Imperial Insurance Company</i> (1886), 34 Ch. D. 234.....	109
<i>Great Northern Railway v. Swaffield</i> (1874) L.R. 9 Ex. 132 (Exch.).....	114
<i>Prager v. Blatspiel, Stamp and Heacock</i> , [1924] 1 KB 566 (KBD).....	117
<i>Jebara v. Ottoman Bank</i> , [1927] 2 KB 254 (C.A.).....	120
<i>China Pacific S.A. v. Food Corporation of India</i> ( <i>The Winston</i> ), [1982] A.C. 939 (H.L.) .....	121
Restatement of Restitution - s. 117 .....	126

## 3. Preserving Another's Health

<i>Hastings v. Semans Village</i> , [1946] 4 D.L.R. 695 (Sask. C.A.).....	128
<i>Matheson v. Smiley</i> , [1932] 2 D.L.R. 787 (Man. C.A.).....	132
Restatement of Restitution - s. 116.....	134

## 4. Discharging Another's Liability

<i>Owen v. Tate</i> , [1975] 2 All E.R. 129 (C.A.).....	136
<i>County of Carleton v. City of Ottawa</i> , [1965] S.C.R. 663.....	143
<i>Norton v. Haggett</i> (1952), 85 A. 2d 571 (Vt. S.C.) .....	145

## 5. Incontrovertible Benefits

<i>Regional Municipality of Peel v. Her Majesty the Queen in right of</i> <i>Canada</i> (1992), 98 D.L.R. (4th) 140 (S.C.C.).....	147
--	-----

# IV. MISTAKEN PAYMENTS

## 1. The Irrelevance of Fault

<i>Kelly v. Solari</i> (1841), 9 M & W 54, 152 E.R. 24 .....	161
<i>Clark v. Eckroyd</i> (1885), 12 O.A.R. 425.....	163
<i>R.E. Jones v. Waring and Gillow</i> , [1926] A.C. 670 (H.L.) .....	166

## 2. The Nature of the Mistake

<i>Aiken v. Short</i> (1856), 1 H. & N. 210, 156 E.R. 1180 .....	170
Birks, An Introduction to the Law of Restitution (1985) 148-154.....	171
<i>Barclays Bank Ltd. v. W. J. Simms Son &amp; Cooke (Southern) Ltd.</i> , [1979] 3 All E.R. 522 (Q.B.).....	174



<i>David Securities v. Commonwealth Bank of Australia</i> (1992) 175 C.L.R. 353 (H.C. Australia) .....	183
<i>Lowe v. Wells Fargo &amp; Co. Express</i> (1908), 96 p. 74 (S.C. of Kansas) .....	184
<i>Larner v. London County Council</i> , [1949] 1 All E.R. 964 (C.A.) .....	186
<i>Lady Hood of Avalon v. MacKinnon</i> , [1909] 1 Ch. 476 .....	188

### 3. Change of Position

<i>Rural Municipality of Storthoaks v. Mobil Oil Canada Ltd.</i> (1975), 55 D.L.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.) .....	191
<i>Lipkin Gorman v. Karpnale</i> , [1992] 4 All E.R. 512 (H.L.) .....	193
<i>RBC Dominion Securities Inc. v. Dawson</i> (1994), 111 D.L.R. (4th) 230 (Nfld. C.A.) .....	205
<i>South Tyneside Metropolitan Borough Council v. Svenska International plc</i> [1995] 1 All E.R. 545 (Q.B.D., Comm. Ct.) .....	213
<i>Dextra Bank &amp; Trust Co Ltd v Bank of Jamaica</i> , 2002] 1 All ER (Comm) 193 (PC) 1 All ER (Comm) 193 (PC) .....	220
<i>Cheese v. Thomas</i> [1994] 1 All E.R. 35 (C.A., Civ. Div.) .....	225

### 4. Mistake of Law and Invalid Exactions

<i>Hydro Electric Commission of Nepean Twp. v. Ontario Hydro</i> (1982), 132 D.L.R. (3d) 193 (S.C.C.) .....	231
<i>Air Canada v. British Columbia</i> (1989), 59 D.L.R. (4th) 161 (S.C.C.) .....	241
<i>Commissioner of State Revenue (Victoria) v. Royal Insurance Australia Ltd.</i> (1994) 182 C.L.R. 51 (H.C. Australia) .....	251
<i>Kleinwort Benson v. Birmingham City Council</i> [1994] 4 All E.R. 733 (C.A., Civ. Div.) .....	256
<i>Garland v. Consumers' Gas Co.</i> L.R. (4 <sup>th</sup> ) 161 (S.C.C.) .....	260

## V. MISTAKEN BENEFITS

<i>Nicholson v. St. Denis</i> (1975), 8 O.R. (2d) 315 (C.A.) .....	271
<i>Greenwood v. Bennett</i> , [1973] 1 Q.B. 195 (C.A.) .....	275
<i>Gidney v. Shank</i> [1995] 5 W.W.R. 385 (Man Q.B.) .....	279
<i>Gidney v. Shank</i> reversed [1996] 2 W.W.R. 383 (Man C.A.) .....	285
<i>Montreuil v. The Ontario Asphalt Company</i> (1921), 63 S.C.R. 401 .....	287
<i>LAC Minerals Ltd. v. International Corona Resources Ltd.</i> (1987), 44 D.L.R. (4th) 592 (Ont. C.A.); (1989) 61 D.L.R. (4th) 14 (S.C.C.) .....	295

## VI. BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER COMPULSION

<i>Astley v. Reynolds</i> (1731), 93 E.R. 939 K.B. ....	301
---	-----

<i>Skeate v. Beale</i> (1841), 113 E.R. 688 .....	302
<i>Knutson v. The Bourkes Syndicate</i> , [1941] S.C.R. 419 .....	303
<i>Peter Kiewit Sons' Co. of Canada v. Eakins Construction Ltd.</i> , [1960] S.C.R. 361 .....	305
<i>Morton Construction Co. Ltd. v. City of Hamilton</i> , [1962] O.R. 154 (C.A.).....	310
<i>Smith v. William Charlick Ltd.</i> (1924) 34 C.L.R. 38 (H.C.).....	312
<i>Pao On v. Lau Yiu</i> , [1979] 3 All E.R. 65 (P.C.).....	315
<i>Universe Tankships Inc. of Monrovia v. International Transport</i> <i>Workers Federation</i> , [1983] A.C. 366 (H.L.) .....	321
<i>Thorne v. Motor Trade Association</i> , [1937] A.C. 797 (H.L.) .....	327
<i>CTN Cash and Carry Ltd. v. Gallaher</i> , [1994] 4 All E.R. 714 .....	330
<i>Eadie v. Township of Brantford</i> , [1967] S.C.R. 523.....	334

## VII. RESTITUTION FOR WRONGS

### 1. Tortious Wrongs

<i>Lamine v. Dorrell</i> (1701), Ld. Ray. 1216.....	338
<i>United Australia v. Barclays Bank</i> , [1941] A.C. 1 (H.L.) .....	339
<i>Phillips v. Homfray</i> (1883), 24 Ch. D. 439 .....	344
<i>Strand Electric and Engineering v. Brisford Entertainments</i> , [1952] 2 Q.B. 246 (C.A.) .....	348
<i>Olwell v. Nye and Nissen</i> , 173 P. 2d 652 (Wash. S.C., 1946).....	353

### 2. Breaches of Fiduciary Obligation

<i>Reading v. Attorney General</i> , [1951] A.C. 507 (H.L.) .....	356
<i>Attorney-General for Hong Kong v. Reid</i> , [1994] 1 A.C. 324 (P.C.) .....	361

### 3. Breaches of Contract

<i>British Motor Trade Association v. Gilbert</i> , [1951] 2 All E.R. (641) Ch.D.).....	370
<i>New Orleans v. Firemen's Charitable Association</i> , 9 SO. 486 (La S.C., 1891).....	372
<i>Adras Building Materials v. Harlow &amp; Jones</i> , February 11, 1988 (Supreme Court of Israel); [1995] Restitution Law Review 235 .....	373
<i>Attorney General v. Blake</i> [2000] 4 All E.R. 385 (H.L.).....	382